

The 1st Meeting of the TCHS Sub-Committee for Redevelopment, formed by the MC in the General Body meeting (held on 22/9/2019), was held on 26th Oct, 2019 at the Society office at 4 p.m.

Members present:

Ashok Maskeri
Dattu Sharma
Gurudutt Burde
Anoop Ulpe
Ajith Bhat
Neha Dholakia
Vinay Yederi (Rep of Bldg. No.16)
Sharad Nadkarni (Bldg. 17-28)
Anant Nadkarni
Aditya Mankikar (MC Rep)

The Following members were unanimously appointed as office bearers:
Chairman of the Sub Committee – Dattu Sharma
Treasurer - Ashok Maskeri
Secretary - Anant Nadkarni

Dattu Sharma highlighted the error in the date, printed on the Terms of Reference handed over by the MC. This was handed over on 20th Oct to the Sub-Committee – for Redevelopment by Shri Mahesh Kalyanpur – Chairman of the MC.
He said he will take it up with the MC Chairman & will get an amended copy.

Ajit Bhat then read out the Terms of Reference that were relevant from the CHS point of view.

It was decided to have Representatives on the Sub Committee from other institutions present on the premises of TCHS like KSA, Sundatta High School and building no. 16.

The question of Legacy & Associate Membership came up for discussion.

Dattu Sharma had volunteered in the AGM to help members to have proper documents in place in the form of a Will or a Nomination Form with the Society to avoid any kind of conflicts post the death of a member.

The importance of having Associate Members was also discussed. In the event a member was unable to attend any meetings called by the MC, be it an AGM or an EGM or any other meeting where members had to be present, then an Associate Member could attend in place of the actual Member to facilitate discussions & passing of important resolutions & conclude issues that needed prompt attention.
The duties of Associate Members were discussed.

Dattu Sharma volunteered to procure a DCR-Development Control Rules from one of the Govt. Retail shops where such booklets / material was sold.

The Terms of Reference issued by the MC had a clause which said improve / renovate / redevelop. This clause had to be amended as per the Sub Committee.

If for any reason a sub-committee member is unable to attend 3 consecutive meetings then it was decided to coopt another member in his/her place.

The meeting ended with the decision to hold the next one on 17th November, 2019 at 5 p.m.

The Minutes of the 2nd Meeting of the TCHS Sub-Committee for Redevelopment, was held on 16th Nov, 2019 at the Society office at 7 p.m.

Members present:

Dattu Sharma – Chairman
Anant Nadkarni - Secretary
Ashok Maskeri
Gurudutt Burde
Satish Burde
Anoop Ulpe
Sharad Nadkarni
Neha Dholakia
Shruti Gokarn
Ravi Bijoor (MC Rep)
Hem Dholakia (MC Rep)

Confirmation of minutes of the previous meeting

The minutes of the 1st Sub-Committee Meeting held on 26th, October, 2019 were approved & ratified by the members.

Extension of time for presenting Feasibility Report

The Chairman on behalf of the sub-com requested the MC representative to extend the date of presenting the Feasibility Report from 31st March, 2019 to 31st August, 2020. This would also match with the date of the AGM that generally takes place in the month of Sep of every calendar year. Shri Ravi Bijoor agreed to take it up with Managing Committee.

Role to be played by Ms. Shruti Gokarn & Ms. Neha Dholakia

Both the members present viz. Ms. Shruti Gokarn & Ms. Neha Dholakia accepted the role of a PRO to be played on behalf of the Sub Com. This would primarily include interacting & answering various queries raised by the Society members on the subject of re-development. However they were cautioned not to give any information directly as of now on the process as it was in a very preliminary stage.

Specific Duties to be taken by Sum-Com members

The Chairman suggested that each committee member should take up one responsibility to speed the process of preparing a Feasibility Report. In this context the members agreed as follows:

Shri Satish Burde – Technical issues – Selection Process – PMC's – Presentations
/ Liasoning with BMC

Shri Ashok Maskeri – Treasurer

Shri Anoop Ulpe – volunteered to secure a copy of the DCR

Shri Gurudutt Burde – any role as the Chairman may find deem fit for him

All other members also volunteered to take up responsibilities as and when required.

Discussion on main subject of Re-development

The Chairman Shri Dutt Sharma informed that the DCR Amendment 2016 to 2019 was released by the BMC but a copy of the same was not available on the internet. Shri Anoop Ulpe volunteered to pick up the same from the related office.

Dutt Sharma suggested that the DCR should be shared with Vinay Yederi & Ravi Bijoor to study & understand the legal implications on the redevelopment project.

The role of a PMC was discussed. Which was mainly to give a "Suggestive Report".

The members decided to call as many PMC's as possible during the course of the month for a presentation.

Hem Dholakia suggested the name of M/s Nanda Borkar & Associates.

Ms. Neha Dholakia suggested M/s CBRE.

Dutt Sharma informed that he would talk to Jeppu Bharat Rao – Anandamid & Co. & fix up a presentation.

Hem Dholakia also suggested that we should be talking to self-developed societies on the challenges faced by them during the course of implementing their plan.

Ms. Neha Dholakia suggested that a formal invitation should be sent to KSA & Sundatta High School to join the Re-development Sub Committee & be part of the Feasibility study. A professionally qualified youngster was a preference from their end.

It was decided to add Shri Ravi Bijoor & Shri Hem Dholakia to the Telegram Group.

The Committee decided that the date for the next meeting can be fixed depending on the convenience of all members.

The Minutes of the 3rd Meeting of the TCHS Sub-Committee for Redevelopment, was held on 30th Dec, 2019 at the Society office at 7.30 p.m.

Members present:

Dattu Sharma – Chairman
Anant Nadkarni - Secretary
Ashok Maskeri
Gurudutt Burde
Satish Burde
Anoop Ulpe
Sharad Nadkarni
Ravi Bijoor (MC Rep)

Confirmation of minutes of the previous meeting

The minutes of the 2nd Sub-Committee Meeting held on 16th November, 2019 were approved & ratified by the members.

The Chairman Shri Dutt Sharma informed the members that Shri Shivshankar Murdeshwar who had joined the Sub Committee, when it was formed, to represent KSA, has advised him that he would not be able to attend such meetings in future due to health issues. Shri Dutt Sharma then suggested that a replacement be found for Shri Shivshankar Murdeshwar immediately.

The Sub-Committee then discussed various points on arranging PMC Presentations. Shri Dutt Sharma informed that Shri Amit Savur a PMC suggested by Shri Mahesh Kalyanpur Chairman of the MC was not interested in doing a Presentation, citing current political instability in the State and no clarity on the DCR or Re-development Guidelines from the State Govt.

Shri Dutt Sharma informed the members that he had forwarded a PPP sent by PMC M/s NCCL and requested all to go through it thoroughly. The members also discussed about the DCR which was still not available in print resulting in an unclear situation on the subject of Redevelopment.

The members decided that Shri Satish Burde and Shri Gurudutt Burde coordinate amongst themselves and arrange such PMC Presentations. A tentative slot for 4th Jan, 2020 at 4 p.m. was agreed by all members to hold a PMC Presentation.

The meeting ended with a consensus that PMC Presentations should be arranged soon.

The Minutes of the 4th Meeting of the TCHS Sub-Committee for Redevelopment, was held on 30th January, 2020 at the Society office at 7.10 p.m.

Members present:

Dattu Sharma – Chairman
Anant Nadkarni - Secretary
Ashok Maskeri - Treasurer
Anoop Ulpe
Gurudutt Burde
Satish Burde
Satyendra Kumble (MC Rep)
Vinay Yaderi (Rep. bldg. no.16)

For want of quorum the meeting started at 7.10 p.m. instead of the scheduled time of 6.45 p.m. as per the Notice sent to all the members of the Sub-Committee.

Confirmation of minutes of the previous meeting

The minutes of the 3rd Sub-Committee Meeting held on 30th December, 2019 were approved & ratified by the members.

Fixed Day for conducting a Sub-Committee Meeting

The members suggested & discussed the subject of conducting a Sub Committee Meeting on a fixed day of a month for the convenience of all.

This would facilitate members to block the date in advance and schedule their personal/business meetings accordingly.

It was therefore unanimously agreed to hold such meetings on every 2nd Wednesday of the month.

The Chairman Shri Dutt Sharma reiterated that members should make every effort to be present for all the meetings called & further explained the importance of contributing to the objective of this set up.

Members were given a free hand to step down in case they had any personal reasons that would stop them from participating in the functioning of the committee.

The case of Shri Ajit Bhat, one of the members was brought to light wherein he had missed 2 consecutive meetings earlier due to unavoidable circumstances & was also not present for this meeting.

Going forward members were requested to be present for all meetings.

Appointment of New Member to the Sub-Committee.

Dr. Uday Andar was earlier recommended by some members to replace the outgoing member Shri Shivshankar Murdeshwar who had stepped down due to ill health. The Sub Committee unanimously appointed Dr. Andar as a new member in place of the outgoing member.

Mrs Nandita Halady had expressed her desire through a Managing Committee member to join the sub-committee to represent building no.16. However since Shri Vinay Yaderi was already appointed earlier to represent that bldg. it was not possible to appoint her. The MC member Shri Satyendra Kumble was requested to convey this message to her.

Building wise Layout Plans

It was very vital to share building wise layout plans with the PMC's who had done a Presentation to the Sub Committee so far to enable them to give us an offer.

Shri Dutt Sharma informed the members that he had spoken to Sujay Nadkarni, Consulting Architect to recommend a few Surveyors to carry out a survey in a detailed manner for the entire complex. He said he would get back asap.

PMC Presentations & Schedules

The Sub Committee took on record the Presentation done by PMC:

M/s Daisairia & Associates on 6th Jan, 2020.

M/s Ballal Engineering & Consultants - Girish Ranade were scheduled to give a presentation at 7.30 p.m. this evening.

DCR availability

Shri Dutt Sharma brought to the notice of the members that the DCR was still not available in print.

The meeting with a Vote of thanks to the Chair.

The Minutes of the 5th Meeting of the TCHS Sub-Committee for Redevelopment, was held on 12th February, 2020 at the Society office at 7.50 p.m.

Members present:

Dattu Sharma – Chairman
Anant Nadkarni - Secretary
Ashok Maskeri - Treasurer
Anoop Ulpe - Member
Ajit Bhat - Member
Satyendra Kumble - (MC Rep)
Vinay Yaderi - (Rep. bldg. no.16)

For want of quorum the meeting started at 7.50 p.m. instead of the scheduled time of 7.30 p.m. as per the Notice sent to all the members of the Sub-Committee.

Confirmation of minutes of the previous meeting

The minutes of the 4th Sub-Committee Meeting held on 30th January, 2019 were read out. There were certain additions to be made. This would be ratified during the next PMC Meeting.

Review of Presentations done by various PMC's

The Sub Committee took on record the Presentation's done by PMC's:

M/s J. Bharat Rao

M/s Daisairia & Associates on 6th Jan, 2020.

M/s Ballal Engineering & Consultants on 30th Jan, 2020

M/s Mangurdekar & Associates on 4th Feb, 2020

A Presentation by Nitin Naik – M/s Perfect Project Management Consultants Pvt. Ltd. was proposed on 14th Feb, 2020 or any suitable date mutually agreed.

The Sub Committee took on record the appointment of 3 Surveyors who had been approached to carry out a Survey on the Talmakiwadi layout. The offer given by the Surveyors would be presented to the MC for approval.

The 3 Surveyors were : Kochrekar, Salunkhe & Arolkar

DCR availability

The Chairman, Shri Dutt Sharma brought to the notice of the members that a copy of the DCR was purchased by him from the office of PEATA India [Practising Engineers Architects and Town Planners Association (India)] at his own cost.

A book titled “Compendium of Self-Redevlopment” written by Mr. Subhash Lalla, ex. Bureaucrat, & published by Mr. Ramesh Prabhu was also purchased by him at his own cost. It was suggested that copies of both the books be purchased for the Society office.

The next Sub Committee Meeting was scheduled for 11th March, 2020.

The meeting ended with a Vote of thanks to the Chair.

The Minutes of the 6th Meeting of the TCHS Sub-Committee for Redevelopment, was held on 11th March, 2020 at the Society office at 7.30 p.m.

Members present:

Dutt Sharma – Chairman
Anant Nadkarni - Secretary
Ashok Maskeri - Treasurer
Anoop Ulpe - Member
Ajit Bhat - Member
Satyendra Kumble - (MC Rep)
Vinay Yaderi - (Rep. bldg. no.16)
Ms. Shruti Gokarn - Member

Confirmation of minutes of the previous meeting

The minutes of the 5th Sub-Committee Meeting held on 12th February, 2020 were read out. The Committee ratified & approved the minutes for filing.

Resignation of Members

The resignation of the following Sub Committee members was accepted and placed on record.

Shri Satish Burde
Shri Gurudutt Burde
Shri Sharad Nadkarni
Shri Hem Dholakia
Mrs Neha Dholakia

The Chairman placed on record the effort & contribution made by each one of them and wished them luck for their future.

The Members then discussed the task of looking for replacement for the members who had resigned. It was preferred to get Professionals to join the Sub Committee. It was suggested that Architects, Civil Engineers, Professionals who had worked on such Self/Re-development projects should be invited to join as Advisory Members.

Shri Dutt Sharma then agreed to talk to Dr. Uday Andar and Ms. Shruti Gokarn to respond to messages & attend the meetings as and when scheduled.

Review of Presentations by PMC's & Survey Report.

PMC, Nitin Naik owner of M/s Perfect Project Management Consultants Pvt. Ltd. had backed out due to health reasons.

The Sub Committee then discussed the importance of a Layout Survey to be given to any PMC to draw their proposal. In this regard it was determined that:

- 1) A Survey is a must & is a need.
- 2) Cost of Survey – A comparison would be given by the Chairman Shri Dutt Sharma to the MC to finalize.
- 3) Survey Report to be procured as earlier as possible.
- 4) Survey Report drawings – area mentioned therein & mentioned on the Property Card to be matched, compared & ratified.

The next Sub Committee Meeting was scheduled for 8th April, 2020.

The meeting ended with a Vote of thanks to the Chair.

The Minutes of the 7th Meeting of the TCHS Sub-Committee for Redevelopment held on 10th October, 2020 at 7.00 p.m. via the Zoom Video Communication.

Members present:

Dutt Sharma – Chairman
Anant Nadkarni – Secretary
Ashok Maskeri - Treasurer
Anoop Ulpe - Member
Ajit Bhat - Member
Satyendra Kumble - (MC Rep)

Confirmation of minutes of the previous meeting

The minutes of the 6th Sub-Committee Meeting held on 11th March, 2020 were read out. The Committee ratified & approved the minutes for filing.

Recap of all findings done in the previous meetings.

It was suggested by the Secretary Anant Nadkarni that the Sub-Com should merge with the Managing Committee to speed up the process of redevelopment. The Sub-Com had already lost 7 months due to the pandemic and hence there was a need to speed up matters.

This is actually a continuation of the last meeting which was adjourned / deferred due to a lack of quorum.

The first resolution was the reappointment of Hem Dholakia to the Sub Committee till he's in the country.

The PMC represented by Shri Puranik was scheduled to join the meeting but had excused himself at the last moment due to a sudden death in his family.

Shri Satyendra Kumble stated that Shri Puranik has stated that the PMC he represents is both willing and able to advise and conduct the process of redevelopment as a turnkey project.

It was an optimistic commitment but needed clarification and documentary assurance.

Both Ms. Sumedha Gore and the PMC represented by Shri Puranik are scheduled to meet up with the Sub Committee at a future date convenient for all. Tentatively 6th and 7th Nov at 8 pm. respectively.

A common format agreed upon by all our members is to be drawn up for approval and approximate estimates to be invited from the PMC's so as a clear inference and comparison is possible.

More PMC's to be invited by members if possible at the earliest juncture.

The meeting was concluded with a vote of thanks to the chair.

The Minutes of the 8th Meeting of the TCHS Sub-Committee for Redevelopment, was held on 27th February, 2021 at 1.00 p.m. at the Society office.

Members present:

Dutt Sharma – Chairman

Anant Nadkarni - Secretary

Ashok Maskeri - Treasurer

Shruti Gokarn - Member

Satyendra Kumble - (Managing Committee Rep)

Confirmation of minutes of the previous meeting

The minutes of the 7th Sub-Committee Meeting held on 10th October, 2020 via the Zoom Communication System was pending & had to be drafted & presented to the Sub Com.

Review responses of PMC's & set parameters

Shri Ashok Maskeri had sent out Questionnaires to all the PMC's that the Sub Com had met after it was formed.

Ms. Shruti Gokarn had done a follow up for responses & had even resent these Questionnaires to a couple of them who had not received due to change in email ids or other reasons.

The Sub Com discussed the likely Parameters to be set to short list PMC's, they are:

Pricing / Costing

Past experience / Number & type of projects handled in the past – Commercial / Residential

Funding assistance

Time frame for completing projects

The Sub Com members also discussed seeking extension from the Managing Committee to present its feasibility / assessment report on redevelopment.

It was decided that the members would start assessing all the responses received from the PMC's in the upcoming week. The intention was to do an assessment on a personal level & then share views.

The next tentative date to meet & share views on the PMC's received was fixed as 7th March, 5 p.m.

CT Station Survey

The Chairman Shri Dutt Sharma shared 4 quotations received from various Technical companies to conduct a CT Station survey in the society premises. The quotations received were from:

M/s S.K.Arolkar & Co. – Rs.39810.00 + GST (Rs.5/sq mt DGPS) + Site Certificate Rs.15000.00

M/s SurveyorsLand – Rs.86000.00 + GST

M/s K.K.Enterprises – Rs.112000.00 + GST

M/s Ballal Engineering – Rs.36000.00 + GST

Apparently the quote received from M/s Ballal Eng. did not have a clear Scope of Work.

An email was sent to them immediately from the Society office asking for more details on the work to be carried out.

It was also decided that if the Scope of work matched with the quotes given by other Surveyors then the job would be awarded to M/s Ballal Engineering.

12 Specific Duties assigned to the Sub-Com

The Secretary, Anant Nadkarni read out all the duties assigned to the Sub Com by the Managing Committee when it was formed. The Sub Com discussed the same at length.

It was decided that Shri Dutt Sharma would activate the website of TCHS.

Identify Volunteers from each building

The Sub Com discussed & concluded that each building should have volunteers to assist & address issues related to legacy & of course the forthcoming redevelopment issue.

However caution had to be exercised at this stage by the appointed volunteers to address only matters related to Associate Membership or Nominations.

There were names suggested by the Sub Com members who could be approached to volunteer & participate in the process.

The names are as follows:

Bldg. No.

1 – Mahesh & Sanjana Kalyanpur

2 – Devdutt Kulkarni / Paritosh Divgi

1A – Mrs Vidya Hemmady

3-5 – Shruti Gokarn / Satyendra Kumble

4-6 – Kiran & Tulsi Manjeshwar / Tejas Balvally

8 – Gayatri Sirur / Anil Baidur

7 – Milind Voketur / Sandeep Kudva

9 – Ischit Sharma

15 – Amit Savkur / Sneha Shah / Leena Pongurlekar

17 – Sahil Nadkarni / Yatin Nadkarni

16 – Mrs. Nivedita Nadkarni

The meeting ended with a Vote of thanks to the Chair.

The Minutes of the 9th Meeting of the TCHS Sub-Committee for Redevelopment, was held on 14th March, 2021 at 5.00 p.m. at the Society office.

Members present:

Dutt Sharma – Chairman

Anant Nadkarni - Secretary

Ashok Maskeri - Treasurer

Shruti Gokarn – Member

Ajit Bhat - Member

Satyendra Kumble - (Managing Committee Rep)

Dr. Uday Andar – Via Google Meet Digital Communication

Dr. Hem Dholakia – Via Google Meet Digital Communication

Confirmation of minutes of the previous meeting

The minutes of the 8th Sub-Committee Meeting held on 27th February, 2021 were ratified & signed by the members.

Review of Responses sent by PMC's & Parameters for selection

The responses received from various PMC's on the Questionnaire sent to them earlier by the Sub Com were reviewed.

Important factors & parameters like:

Past experience in handling projects of our size

Past experience in handling self-development projects

Number of projects handled in as many years

The professional qualification of the owners involved

& such other relevant points were discussed which were of prime importance.

An excel worksheet with comparative data was collated by Dr. Hem Dholakia and circulated amongst the Sub Com members.

Review of Quotations received from Station Surveyors

It was imperative to conduct a Station Survey of the entire land of TCHS & quotations for this purpose were sought and then presented in the earlier meeting.

So far the Sub Com had received 4 such Station Survey quotations with incomplete data on the Scope of work. An email to that effect was sent to two Surveyors & response from them was awaited.

The Chairman Shri Dutt Sharma informed the Sub Com that he would seek the help of Shri Vishal Wagle, Senior Engineer from the Kalpataru Group to connect with a reliable surveyor from the industry who could render quality service at an economical price.

Discussion on Points pertinent to the Project

The Sub Com discussed various points pertinent to the project that would need a consensus from the General Body.

The Role of a PMC, its Scope of Work and Objectives of appointment were discussed. The information gathered after conducting meetings with various PMC's had assisted in collating information on the processes involved, approvals required, contractors etc.

Under the current circumstances it was observed that no major Real Estate / Construction companies were ready to take up any redevelopment projects due to a slack in the industry.

The Sub Com estimated a minimum cost of Rs.500 Cr for the entire project.

Certain facts regarding cost of borrowing, collateral required by the lender were discussed.

The Commercial aspects of making the whole project viable was also discussed. The Sub Com discussed the various ways in which saleable flats could be constructed to raise funds. It was suggested that buildings could be Lead Certified to attract Bhanap NRI's to purchase.

The meeting ended with a Vote of thanks to the Chair.

The Minutes of the 10th Meeting of the TCHS Sub-Committee for Redevelopment was held on 16th May, 2021 at 5.00 p.m. via Zoom Communication System.

Members present:

Dutt Sharma – Chairman
Anant Nadkarni - Secretary
Ashok Maskeri - Treasurer
Anoop Ulpe - Member
Ajit Bhat - Member
Satyendra Kumble - (Managing Committee Rep)
Vinay Yaderi – Member (Bldg. #16 Rep)
Shivanand Sanadi – KSA Rep
Hemant Kombrabail – BVES Rep
Vishal Wagle – Senior Engineer, Kalpataru Group

Opening Remarks by the Chairman

The Chairman, Shri Dutt Sharma welcomed the new members of the Sub-Committee viz. Shri Shivanand Sanadi – Representing Kanara Saraswat Association & Shri Hemant Kombrabail – Representing Balak Vrinda Education Society.

There was an official invitation sent to the two institutions by the Managing Committee to nominate representatives to the Sub Committee.

This was perceived to be Mutually beneficial to all the Institutions to concurrently get into the Redevelopment Process.

The other two new member's viz. Shri Vandan Shiroor of KSA & Shri Kishore Surkund of BVES could not attend the meeting due to prior commitments.

Shri Dutt Sharma commenced the meeting by giving a detailed background on the work done by the Sub Committee so far and the meetings conducted with the various PMC's prior to the lockdown (March 2020) and post Sep/Oct 2020 when the restrictions were eased.

He reiterated the importance of conducting a Total Station Survey to determine the total plot area of the society along with the exact position of Drainage Chambers, Storm Water Drains & trees etc.

He then introduced Shri Vishal Wage – Senior Civil Engineer with Kalpataru Group who was present by invitation. Shri Vishal Wage had helped TCHS find a reliable Surveyor, namely, M/s S.P.Enterprises to conduct the Total Station Survey. The quote given by this Surveyor was the most economical amongst all the quotes received by the Sub Committee with very elaborate scope of work.

Shri Dutt Sharma then explained the Station Survey Report to the entire Sub Committee by sharing the plot drawings on the screen. Shri Vishal then chipped in with his comments & views on the importance of such an exercise & answered all questions raised by the members.

The Sub Committee put on record & appreciated the support & cooperation extended by Shri Vishal Wage to complete this exercise. Requesting him to help in our future endeavours, which he gracefully accepted, by making it clear that he was doing it purely as service to our society without expecting any remuneration.

Digital Meeting with Shri Chandrashekhar Prabhu

Shri Dutt Sharma then suggested an early digital meeting with Shri Chandrashekhar Prabhu to take the process forward.

He informed the members that he would forward the Station Survey Report along with the Property Card and Building Drawings to Shri Chandrashekhar Prabhu through Dr. Uday Andar. Requesting Shri Chandrashekhar Prabhu for as many Concept Drawings from the Network of his Architects, that he had suggested to us, in his previous Meeting. This would enable us to know the approximate costs of Design, Construction and implementation, stage wise, to go to the next level of understanding.

He also requested all members to prepare a list of questions that they felt could be put up to Shri Prabhu. It was decided that all members would share the questions on the telegram group. A tentative date i.e. Saturday i.e. 22nd May was fixed for the meeting, between 5 p.m. to 7 p.m. However the availability of Shri Prabhu, at short notice, would be checked and conveyed to the members in due course.

Shri Dutt Sharma also informed the members that, we should endeavour to deliver, the entire feasibility study & report to the Managing Committee, within the next 3 months to complete the role assigned to us.

Confirmation of minutes of the previous meeting

The minutes of the 7th & 9th Sub Committee Meeting's held on 10th October, 2020 & 14th March, 2021 respectively were ratified & approved by the members.

The meeting ended with a Vote of thanks to all the members & the Chair.

The Minutes of the 12th Adjourned Meeting of the TCHS Sub-Committee for Redevelopment held on 8th November, 2021 at 8.00 p.m. via Zoom Communication System.

Members present:

Dutt Sharma – Chairman
Anant Nadkarni - Secretary
Ashok Maskeri - Treasurer
Anoop Ulpe - Member
Ajit Bhat - Member
Vinay Yaderi – Member (Bldg. #16)
Kishore Surkund – BVES Rep

This meeting is a continuation of the Sub Com meeting initially held on 31st October, 2021 at 11 a.m. and was adjourned for want of quorum.

Shortlist 3 PMC's to approach for Feasibility Report

The Sub Com in its meeting held on 21st August, 2021 had agreed & decided that all members will share their 3 preferences of PMC's they had met so far.

In order of preference shared by the members the names are:

1. Sumedha Gore
2. Mullerpatan
3. Jeppu Bharat Rao

The Sub Com was appraised, that the MC had a blanket approval from the General Body to incur expenses upto Rs.1 lakh for any kind of exploratory study expenses, that could arise, towards redevelopment feasibility study.

As of date, the MC has spent about 50000 towards cost of Station Survey Report from SP Surveyors, with a sanctioned surplus of only Rs.50,000. Approaching 3 PMC's would definitely need a higher sum, going by the offers received from the three suggested PMCs, and as the available surplus is inadequate. It was decided to write to the MC and request them for additional sanction of funds, to meet with the Feasibility Report expenses.

Dutt Sharma said he would prepare a Scope of Work Sheet for the PMC's to offer their Feasibility Report and other members can add or delete the suggestions. However he would initially share this with the MC & notify them officially on the 3 PMC's that the Sub Com had shortlisted to approach with a rough idea on the fees payable to them.

Only on the approval of the MC would the Sub Com then approach the PMC's and invite them for negotiating on the fees for such a Report.

Shri Dutt Sharma also informed the members that there was no feedback from BVES on the details that were requested, pertaining to the Building Design and Built-up Space currently occupied by them, individual room sizes, areas etc.

Shri Kishore Surkund, BVES Rep assured that these details would be made available by Wed 10th Nov, 2021.

Shri Dutt Sharma then stated that he would write to the MC immediately after receiving the details from BVES and the concurrence of all subcommittee members on the shared measurements.

He also said that a SUB Com meeting would be convened to open the FRESH OFFERS FROM PMCs, in the presence of all members, so that it is a transparent process and to avoid any kind of ambiguity or reservations, on the issue from any quarters.

Identify Volunteers from each Building of TCHS / Review Draft Letter for circulation

The Sub Com discussed the issue of mobilizing members on the subject of redevelopment.

This could be done through a system of appointing building wise volunteers to interact and then take opinion from them on the same.

In the meeting held on 25th Sep with Shri Chandrashekhar Prabhu this system was discussed and a draft letter for circulation was shared with the Sub Com members.

Shri Dutt Sharma requested a copy again to review and make any changes, if required. He stated that since he was unwell for 2 months he could not go through the draft letter shared earlier.

Certain names were suggested by the members from each building. The Building wise names are as follows:

Building No.	Name/s
1.	Shri Mahesh Kalyanpur / Sanmesh Kalyanpur
2.	Mrs. Devyani Divgi
3.	Mrs. Vidya Hemmady
3/5.	Shri Satyendra Kumble
4/6	Shri Kiran Manjeshwar & his wife Tulsi
8.	Mrs. Gayatri Sirur (wife of Dr Subodh Sirur)
7.	Shri Deepak / Milind Voketur
9.	Dr. Prakash Mavinkurve
13.	to be identified
15.	Mrs. Leena Pongurlekar
16.	Shri Vinay Yaderi
17.	Shri Sahil Nadkarni (Flat#28)

Every member agreed to review the Draft Letter again and share points that could be added or deleted.

Shri Dutt Sharma suggested that these members be approached and their consent taken to arrange a digital or physical meeting soon to apprise them on the subject.

The meeting ended with a Vote of thanks to the Chair.

The Minutes of the 13th Meeting of the TCHS Sub-Committee for Redevelopment held on 19th December, 2021 at 11.00 p.m. in the TCHS Society office.

Members present:

Dutt Sharma – Chairman
Anant Nadkarni - Secretary
Ashok Maskeri - Treasurer
Satyendra Kumble – MC Rep
Ajit Bhat - Member
Vinay Yaderi – Member (Bldg. #16)
Kishore Surkund – BVES Rep
Vandan Shiroor – KSA Rep

The Chairman Shri Dutt Sharma gave an update on the drawings received from KSA & BVES. He placed on the record that the Sub Com had received the required documents from KSA as well as BVES.

He acknowledged the effort taken by Shri Vandan Shiroor of KSA & Shri Kishore Surkund of BVES to share the documents as requested.

He explained that there was a specific list of documents required by the PMC's to prepare a Feasibility Report. He mentioned that this list was nicely prepared by the Office Manager Ms. Darshana.

He also stated that 1 copy each, duly signed & stamped, be given to the 3 PMC's, the Sub Com was approaching.

Shri Vandan Shiroor suggested that the PMC's should be asked to return back the stamped copies if their proposal is not accepted or in any other case as it may be.

Approval of Minutes

The minutes of the digital meeting of the Sub Com held on 25th Sep, 2021 with Shri Chandrashekar Prabhu was approved by the members.

Similarly the minutes of the digital meeting of the Sub Com held on 8th Nov, 2021 was also approved by the members.

Correspondence between the Sub Com & Managing Committee of TCHS

The Chairman Shri Dutt Sharma apprised the sub com on the correspondence taken place between him & the MC.

He had written an email to the MC seeking approval for approaching 3 PMC's for a Feasibility Report and also an approval to meet the expenses in that regard.

He further stated that the MC had in its reply said that the Sub Com should approach 1 or 2 PMC's only and not 3 as suggested. Moreover there was no specific sanction on the budget required in the email.

He said he then wrote back to the MC asking them for a budgetary sanction but a reply was yet to come.

He placed on record the apprehensions shown on the functioning of the Sub Com and the impression created that the Sub Com was slow and there was a delay in presenting its recommendations to the MC.

Shri Dutt Sharma explained the circumstances under which the Sub Com functioned and the challenges it faced during the lockdown amidst the pandemic. He mentioned that the Sub Com conducted digital meetings amongst themselves, with PMC's, Third Party Builders & Advisors despite all the external challenges it faced.

He further stated that there was a delay from BVES in sharing the required documents which delayed the whole process. He mentioned the challenges faced by Shri Kishore Surkund (BVES Rep) with the school staff to procure the same.

He further explained that BVES on its own were not in a position to handle its redevelopment & hence preferred to be part of the TCHS Redevelopment Project.

Shri Dutt Sharma spoke about the Scope of Work to be shared with the PMC's that the Sub Com was approaching. The same was put up on the Telegram Group for comments from the members.. The members approved the same.

He mentioned about a suggestion given by the MC regarding Point No.20 of the SOW. They were of the opinion that the Floor Plan & the Layout mentioned in Point No.20 should not be requested at this stage as it is likely to increase the cost of procuring the Feasibility Report.

Shri Dutt Sharma clarified in the meeting that if there is no major impact on the cost and the PMC agrees to include the Floor Plan & the Layout within the budget then TCHS could benefit.

The MC Rep Shri Satyendra Kumble explained that the 5 year term of the MC had expired on 31st March, 2021 and that they were now functioning as a caretaker Committee.

Hence an approval in principle was given to the Sub Com to approach PMC's for a Feasibility Report.

The Sub Com also kept on record that there was no objection from any member on the correspondence taken place between Shri Dutt Sharma and the MC.

Shri Vandan Shiroor enquired if there were technical experts around whom the Sub Com could access to read, study & assess its authenticity once the Feasibility Reports were received.

Shri Dutt Sharma explained that members with Technical Knowledge would join the Sub Com in due course once the Reports were received. He also mentioned that the members were free to appoint such Technical experts on the Sub Committee to play the required role.

He recommended the name of Shri Vishal Wagle who had assisted the Sub Com to get the Station Survey done.

Shri Satyendra Kumble suggested the name of Ms. Gaurita Udiaver – a Lawyer by profession to be appointed on the Sub Com. He stated that she had experience of handling the legal aspects of such redevelopment projects.

Shri Dutt Sharma explained certain technical aspects of the existing flats of TCHS. He mentioned that the flats in TCHS were of 7 different types of dimensions. Hence each flat owner would get additional space according to the dimension of the flat he/she owns. To get more clarity on this he had included the Floor Plan & the Layout in the SOW. However the MC had dissuaded him to ask for it at this stage to save cost.

Sharing of costs

Shri Dutt Sharma had suggested to the MC that all expenses should be shared by KSA & BVES as they were also part of the redevelopment project. This was conveyed to the Rep's by the MC of TCHS earlier.

The KSA Rep Shri Vandan Shiroom & BVES Rep Shri Kishore Surkund agreed in principle to this request. However it was agreed that the same would be proportionate to the plot area they occupied.

The Rep's also agreed that they would take it up with their respective Committees for approval.

Draft Letter for members

The draft letter for members of TCHS, circulated to the members on the Telegram Group was approved & taken on record.

Letter for PMC's

The Sub Com agreed to draft a letter inviting the short listed PMC's to furnish a Feasibility Report.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

The Minutes of the 14th Meeting of the TCHS Sub-Committee for Redevelopment held on 19th March, 2022 at 12.30 p.m. in the TCHS Society office.

Members present:

Dutt Sharma – Chairman
Anant Nadkarni - Secretary
Ashok Maskeri – Treasurer
Anoop Ulpe - Member
Satyendra Kumble – Member
Ajit Bhat - Member

Approval of Minutes

The minutes of the meeting of the Sub Com held on 19th Dec, 2021 were approved by the members.

Quotes received for Feasibility Report

The Secretary Anant Nadkarni opened the sealed envelopes received from the 3 PMC's in the presence of all the members of the Sub-Committee. The quotations were read out and the members discussed the merits of each of them.

The quotes were discussed in detail.

There was a budgetary sanction of Rs.3 lakhs from the MC to spend on the Feasibility Report & hence all approvals had to be within the budget.

The Sub Com had spent Rs.50,000 already on the Station Survey.

Ms.Sumedha Gore's quote fitted the bill & hence the members decided to send an approval to her in writing. The other 2 quotes were prohibitive and hence were not considered.

The members decided that the issue of approaching another 2 PMC's for a project feasibility and concept for such large scale project, was imperative, and could be taken up in the upcoming General Body.

The process involved in the redevelopment venture was also discussed again.

The Chairman Shri Dutt Sharma & the members discussed the various steps involved in the redevelopment procedure.

The Clause 33(9) & Clause 33(7) of the DCR were also discussed:

- Under the Development Control Rule (DCR) 33 (9) enables a Developer to use an FSI of 4 to develop an area of a minimum of 4,000 sq. meters.

- Under DCR 33(7) rule that is applied for the redevelopment of buildings, which as against the FSI of 1, the Developers can utilize an FSI of 3. In return, they have to hand over a few flats to MHADA for a specified price.

The question of issuing tenders to appoint builders was raised even after a PMC was appointed. The risks involved in dealing with Builders were discussed and measures as to what could be done to mitigate the risks were also discussed.

The Chairman stated that there should be minimal disputes and complete control over the project.

He further mentioned that the surveyors brought in for station survey were on the panel approved by the BMC.

The chairman apprised that he has been closely following some other projects in Mumbai, to learn the nitty gritty and explained, that in most cases, the builders prefer 33(9) to minimize their costs, and despite that, they end up giving about 27% extra space on an average. Some cases, upto 30% extra space has been provided for existing members.

Ajit Bhat cautioned the members, that despite, we appointing the PMC, eventually business interests dominate and the PMC too is most likely to toe the Developers line as ultimately his revenue is dependent on the progress. He also voiced apprehensions as our Society is very old and not all records are available with the Municipal Corporation.

The need to issuing tenders to appoint builders was raised, after a PMC was appointed. The risks involved in dealing with Builders were discussed and measures as to what could be done to mitigate the risks were also discussed.

Dutt Sharma assured the members that, for this very reason, both our Society Architect as well as the Surveyors chosen were done with due care, to appoint, ones who are on the MCGM approved panel. At the end of the day, it is our Society's duty to manage the PMC as well as litigation if any, with proper legal competence and with minimal or better still, with no disputes. Hence, the need of the hour will be to start shortlisting and eventually appointing competent Lawyer/s for the job.

The subject of increase in Property tax & Maintenance cost was discussed by the members.

It was highlighted that there would be a minimum cost of Rs.12 per sq. foot to a maximum of Rs.36 per sq. foot once the TCHS premises was redeveloped. The question of affordability was also taken up and doubts were raised whether all members would be in a position to pay the increased costs despite receiving a corpus post redevelopment and possibly the need to subsidize the costs via corpus in the Society Account.

The Chairman suggested that phased FSI utilization is perhaps the best solution to reduce upfront costs of the project implementation, so that saleable component can be developed in more than one phase, and more than one building structure. Many builders build additional floors post occupation by the existing members. Trying to use that entire eligibility of the FSI may bring up a challenge in selling additional flats, if it is only for CSBs. However, all this will be clearer, once we get the feasibility report at hand.

It was accepted by the members that the Chairman would address and answer queries of the members in the upcoming General Body meeting to be held on 26th March, 2022.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

The Minutes of the 15th Meeting of the TCHS Sub-Committee for Redevelopment held on 19th July, 2022 at 3.30 p.m. in the TCHS Society office.

Members present:

Dutt Sharma – Chairman
Anant Nadkarni - Secretary
Ashok Maskeri – Treasurer
Satyendra Kumble – Member
Ajit Bhat – Member
Kishore Surkund – BVES Rep

Presentation of Feasibility Report

Ms. Sumedha Gore presented the Feasibility Report using a projector.

She explained & shared information pertaining to the project while presenting her Report:

1) The entire redevelopment activity would take place under Regulation 33(9) of the DCR.

The Regulation reads as follows:

The Development Control Rule (DCR) 33 (9) enables a Developer to use an FSI of 4 to develop an area of a minimum of 4,000 sq. meters.

$33(9) \times \text{Plot Area} = \text{Built Up Area}$

2) The area is more than 4000 square meters & hence a FSI of 4 is available.

3) There are 238 Residential units & 13 Non-Residential units in the TCHS premises.

4) The process of procuring the IOD - Intimation of Disapproval & TDR – Transferable Development Rights will have to be initiated.

5) The new plan will involve relocating school.

6) Free FSI for Office Room, Staircases, Lift area, Lobby, Passages, Ramps, Electric Rooms, Servant's Room's, Fitness Room and Car Park.

7) An Electric Consumer Sub-Station will form part of the new plan.

8) There are approx. 70 types of approvals involved to commission the project.

9) There is no height restriction as per AAI Regulations. The permissible height is 222.92 meters (731 feet) which allows construction upto 70 floors.

10) Open Space deficiency is 77.02.

11) Understanding of Carpet Area under the following:

MOFA - carpet area includes the entire floor area of your property along with the area covered by the balcony.

RERA - "Carpet area" means net usable floor area of an apartment, excluding the area covered by the external walls, area under services, shafts, exclusive balcony or verandah area and exclusive open terrace area, but including the area covered by the internal partition walls of the Apartment.

MHADA - EWS-1BHK Flat -29.76 SQM (320.22 Sq. ft.) MIG-2BHK FLAT-59.76SQM (643.02Sqft.)

12) 1 parking slot per Flat.

800 new parking slots.

13) Approx. 15% additional area + Incentive area.

Entire FSI to be used by society.

14) Saleable area will be calculated as per RERA Carpet.

15) Approx. Construction cost will be Rs.6000.00 per square feet.

Members objected to this & requested her to consider a more realistic cost which could be in the region of approx. Rs.3000.0 per square feet.

16) A routine practice of Soil Investigation will be done.

Soil investigation is to carry out physical testing on site to understand the ground conditions for geotechnical design (foundations, retaining walls & soil improvement).

Shri Satyendra Kumble insisted on sharing realistic/practical figures in terms of additional area that each member would be eligible for.

An idea in terms of the corpus available in figures was also requested.

Ms. Sumedha Gore agreed to add this information & share it with the Sub Com soon.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

The Minutes of the 16th Meeting of the TCHS Sub-Committee for Redevelopment held on Sunday 4th September, 2022 at 11.00 a.m. in the TCHS Society office.

Members present:

Dutt Sharma – Chairman
Anant Nadkarni - Secretary
Satyendra Kumble – Member
Ajit Bhat – Member
Anoop Ulpe - Member
Vinay Yaderi – Bldg.#16 Rep
Shruti Gokarn - Member

Presentation of Feasibility Report

The Amended Feasibility Report furnished by Ms. Sumedha Gore was taken on record by the Sub-Committee.

The various points presented by Ms. Sumedha Gore were discussed by the members at length.

The following queries were raised by the members.

A) The very first point in the SOW has been missed out. To give a breakup of ELIGIBLE AREAS per CS Number of plots for TCHS, KSA and BVES, commensurate with their existing Plot Areas, as they will get a clear idea as to what they can expect by going along with TCHS.

B) 35% - 50% variation in additional area is too wide, need to be more specific to each option available for Redevelopment. Request you to be a bit more specific, may be minimum 45% possible.

C) Bifurcation needed in what is the total area utilized by Allocation of the minimum area norm to Tenements less than 300 Sq.ft. and what will be balance available to other larger premises, plus total Saleable over and above allocation to existing members.

D) We felt the Construction cost of Rs. 3600 per Sq.ft. is high. Bifurcation of cost of Common areas like lift shaft etc. would cost much lesser. Request you to give your inputs.

E) The presentation shows many of the Amenity areas as free from FSI, considering that, exact picture is not represented in terms of costs. FSI may be free, but cost of construction will need to be accounted. Or Free areas discounted.

F) Interest rate is shown only from the Single sourcing agency at 12.5% simple interest, what about other suggestions of Source of funding, and their benchmark interest rates. It may not be viable to avail finance for such a big project from just one source.

G) Project Cost is projected at 246Cr. In the presentation and the same Escalates to 1100 plus Cr. In the comparative statements.

H) Considering even the interest cost it cannot escalate so much.

I) 57Cr. Maximum Net Profit on a project outlay of 1100Cr. The project doesn't sound viable as members may find the profits to be very low. Contingencies provision in the Budget is not given.

J) Overall rework may be needed to segregate the above mentioned poi

It was decided that the above points be communicated to her & clarifications be sought.

Subsequent to the Proposal given by Ms. Sumedha Gore the members had decided to call in another PMC to give a quote for a proposal for redevelopment.

Hence it was decided to invite M/s Verite Value Homes Project Pvt. Ltd. – Surajit Chanda for a meeting to discuss the same. The date would be decided during the course of the week as agreed.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

The Minutes of the 17th Meeting of the TCHS Sub-Committee for Redevelopment held on Sunday 4th October, 2022 at 4.30 p.m. in the TCHS Society office.

Members present:

Dutt Sharma – Chairman
Anant Nadkarni - Secretary
Ashok Maskeri
Satyendra Kumble – Member
Ajit Bhat – Member
Anoop Ulpe - Member
Vinay Yaderi – Bldg.#16 Rep

Approval of quote given by Verite Value Home Projects Pvt.Ltd.

The quote given by Verite for a Feasibility Report was discussed.

The quote read as follows:

Fee & Payment Terms:

- Fee for Detailed Feasibility Study will be INR 1,50,000/- (Indian Rupees One Lakh Fifty Thousand Only). GST will be extra as applicable.
- 50% advance and 50% after submission of report.
- The above amount shall be adjusted from overall fee of Verite Self Development is appointed as Development & Project Management Consultant for the project.
- There should be a provision of INR 40,000/- (approximate) for any documents to be taken out from MCGM if required during the course of the Feasibility Study. However, this amount will depend on the quantum of documents to be procured and difficulty in sourcing them. (This provision is to be kept for any out of pocket expenses towards taking out Society Documents from MCGM. This shall have to be paid on actuals).

The Secretary Anant Nadkarni had negotiated with the Founder Surajit Chanda who agreed to bring down the offer to 1.25 lakhs + GST.

The members approved the same and a decision was made to send an official email to Verite to go ahead with the Feasibility Report on the new terms.

Feasibility Report from Prasad Mullerpattan

The Sub Com after much deliberations had come to a conclusion that Feasibility Report should be procured from atleast 3 PMC's to get a broader idea about a project of such a large size.

In the interim another PMC Prasad Mullerpattan & Nikhil Vaidya had approached the Sub Com and showed interest in giving a Feasibility Report. The Sub Com had shared the SOW with them and had asked him to send the FR based on that.

However the Sub Committee after going through the Feasibility Report received from Prasad & Nikhil observed that the contents were more of general and the parameters laid out in the SOW were not covered. Hence it was decided to communicate with them and call for a meeting if they were serious about the same.

The members decided to give them a 7 day deadline to present a FR covering the parameters laid out in the SOW.

The Chairman Shri Dattu Sharma suggested that collation of data should take place only after all the PMC's are received in the right format and are scrutinized by the Sub Com thoroughly.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.